

Notre-Dame en feu. Perte patrimoniale et opportunités *Notre-Dame on Fire. Heritage Loss and Opportunities*

Visions comparées du patrimoine (Axe Patrimoines, Agora, CY Cergy Paris Université)
Critical Heritage Studies. Epistémologie, réception, actualités (LAHIC, EHESS/CNRS)
GT Émotions/Mobilisations (EMOBI), chantier scientifique de Notre-Dame de Paris
(CNRS-Ministère de la Culture)

15 Janvier 2021 13h00-16h00 – January 15th 1.00-4.00 pm CET

zoom : <https://cyu-fr.zoom.us/j/94933141112?pwd=RmFiUW45REpmcXJU1F4S2VXQkp6Zz09>

ID de réunion : 949 3314 1112

Code secret : HhPU&7a

Dans la continuité de la journée d'étude 2019, cette nouvelle édition interroge l'incendie de 2019 de Notre-Dame de Paris afin de décrire les effets sociaux et les pratiques d'opportunité que l'accident a pu provoquer parmi une myriade d'acteurs dont la relation à la cathédrale varie et se révèle à travers l'incendie. Loin de rechercher les causes de l'événement et de se limiter aux dégâts patrimoniaux, nous puiserons dans la métaphore agricole du *brûlis* afin de montrer en quoi une catastrophe patrimoniale de cette ampleur ne peut se réduire à l'inventaire des pertes, mais permet également de mesurer les effets sociaux, culturels ou scientifiques qu'elle autorise, déploie ou révèle. Dans une perspective comparative, nous réfléchissons à ce que la destruction d'un patrimoine tel que Notre-Dame de Paris nous dit des façons de transformer la catastrophe en opportunité. Nous pourrions ainsi interroger les positionnements contemporains des hommes face à d'autres disparitions patrimoniales dans le monde et penser alors les potentialités derrière la perte.

Following our 2019 study day, we will examine the 2019 fire of Notre-Dame in Paris, to describe the social effects and practices of opportunity the accident may have provoked among a myriad of actors whose relations to the cathedral varied and which were revealed through the fire. Far from exploring the causes of the event or limit ourselves to the heritage damage, we will draw on the metaphor of slash-burn agriculture to show a heritage disaster of this extent cannot be restricted to the inventory of losses, but also enables us to measure the social, cultural, scientific effects it allows, deploys or reveals. Using a comparative perspective, we will reflect on what the destruction of such heritage as Notre-Dame tells us of our ways to transform disasters into opportunities allows us to think about people's contemporary positioning towards other heritage losses and to then reflect upon the potentialities of loss.

PROGRAMME

13h00 **Ouverture / opening** Julie Amiot Guillouet, UMR Héritages, Cergy Paris Université

13h10 **Introduction** Cécile Doustaly, UMR Héritages, Cergy Paris Université

Chairs Anne-Julie Etter, CY ; Fondation des Sciences du Patrimoine
Cyril Isnart, IDEMEC/Mucem

13h15-13h45 **Eva Löfgren**, Department of Conservation, Gothenburg University, Sweden, **“Church Reconstructions and Heritage Practices in a Swedish Context”**

13h45-14h15 **Cécile Doustaly “Exploring Glocal Experiences of Notre-Dame de Paris”**
Concluded by the short film: **“The Time of Cathedrals”** by **Mathilde Ayoub**, Doctoral student, UMR Héritages-EUR Humanités, Création et Patrimoine, CY

14h25-14h45 **Jean-Charles Forgeret**, MAP (*Médiathèque de l’Architecture et du Patrimoine*), **« Les collections et les archives de la MAP sur Notre-Dame de Paris »** (*in French*)

15h00-15h45 **Table-ronde, projet Fondation des Sciences du Patrimoine « Débris, vestiges et reliques. Les décombres de Notre-Dame de Paris, entre matérialités et sacralités »**
Animée par **Claudie Voisenat**, avec **Nathalie Cerezales**, **Jean-Christophe Monferran**, **Gaspard Salatko** (*in French*)

15h45 **Conclusions**
Caroline Bodolec, **Cécile Doustaly**, **Cyril Isnart**, **Claudie Voisenat**

Partner research teams / équipes partenaires

- . UMR 9022 Héritages : Culture(s), Création(s), Patrimoine(s) - Cergy Paris Université (CY)
- . CMI TCT (Cursus Master Ingénierie Territoires, Cultures, Tourisme) ; Master’s PICT (International Projects in Cultures and Tourism), UFR Langues et Etudes Internationale (LEI), Cergy Paris Université (CY)
- . Centre d’études sur la Chine moderne et contemporaine (CECMC), UMR 8173 Chine, Corée, Japon (CCJ), EHESS-CNRS, Paris
- . Institut d’ethnologie méditerranéenne, européenne et comparative (IDEMEC), UMR 7307, Aix Marseille Université-CNRS, Aix-en-Provence

Abstracts

Eva LÖFGREN, *Department of Conservation, University of Gothenburg*
“Church Reconstructions and Heritage Practices in a Swedish Context”

This paper deals with three Swedish church fires and the reconstruction processes that followed on the dramatic events. The Evangelical Lutheran church of Katarina was severely damaged in a fire in 1990, Skaga chapel burned to the ground in 2000, as did the church of Södra Råda in 2001. The rebuilding of the churches coincided with, on the one hand, a decline in church membership and religious activity, and on the other hand a strong public support for maintaining the traditional denomination's church buildings as heritage objects. In this respect, the same conditions prevailed for all three cases, although the fires gave rise to different events with different results. Setting out from a brief overview of Swedish church fires in the 20th century, the paper examines the ways in which the motifs and carrying through of the reconstructions relate to the series of events that once led to the buildings being designated as cultural heritage. What happened when the churches, in quite dissimilar ways, were defined as heritage, proves to be decisive for how the reconstructions were later justified and realised. The paper delves into these cases in order to discuss how heritage processes establish locally specific practices, largely linked to power relations and to the symbiotic relationship between religious and secular values, and how these local practices are reproduced in reconstructions.

Cécile DOUSTALY, *UMR Héritages, CY Cergy Paris Université*
“Exploring Glocal Experiences of Notre-Dame de Paris”

This presentation will provide an overview of the perspectives of research I am exploring within the EMOBI group (CNRS scientific taskforce of Notre-Dame) in relation to glocal representations and experiences of landmark heritage sites. The first strand of research involves a comparative media analysis of the fire's reception in French, British and US media, (TV, Press, social media), the use of heritage experts to reinforce national superiority and the role played by the media in the heritage competition for value recognition and funding after destructions. The second strand explores international visitors' representations, emotions and experiences of Notre-Dame before and since the fire. In contrast with marketing surveys traditionally targeting international visitors, the French online *EMOBI survey* (dir. Claudie Voisenat, Sylvie Sagnes), circulated in the autumn 2020, focused on "expert users" (C. Voisenat). I will present initial analysis of the answers from international visitors it gathered. I will last discuss the challenges of the adaptation and translation of the EMOBI survey in other languages and cultures, which are underway, a project associating the M2 CMI TCT and PICT intercultural and multilingual students.

Mathilde AYOUB, *Doctoral student, UMR Héritages-EUR/Graduate School Humanities, Creation, Heritage, CY*
“Introduction and screening of “The Time of Cathedrals” (April 2019)

This short film is an essay edited the night of Notre-Dame de Paris' fire in analogy with Saint-Elie's Cathedral in Aleppo, a church destroyed during the Syrian War. The voice off compares both catastrophes and their impact on cultural and emotional heritage while the camera dives into the ruins of the Syrian church where men are working on its restoration.

Jean-Charles FORGERET, *MAP-Médiathèque de l'Architecture et du Patrimoine*
“The MAP collections and archives of Notre-Dame de Paris”

The MAP, a service from the Ministry of Culture, conserves the archives of Historic Monuments and photographic heritage of the French State. It holds most of the archives in relation to the protection and restoration of Notre-Dame Cathedral and its objects since the XIXth century. These collections allow to follow the history of the interventions that have been carried out on the monument from 1843 and 1865 until the restoration works which were ongoing when the 15 April 2019 fire happened. The vast set of Eugène Viollet-le-Duc's archival documents, both public and private, constitutes a unique fond to understand the transformations of the edifice and the creation of its furniture and decorations in the XIXth century. The graphic collections of the MAP, which include millions of drawings, maps, photographs and etchings, have proven invaluable to inform the ongoing studies carried out for the restoration of the Cathedral.

Round Table, Foundation for Cultural Heritage Project: “The Debris, the vestige and the relic. The remains of Notre-Dame de Paris, between the material and the sacred.”

Partenaires / Partners : Institut National du Patrimoine ; École du Louvre ; Archives nationales ; CY (AGORA-UMR Héritages) ; Chantier scientifique Notre-Dame de Paris CNRS ; Ministère de la Culture

Claudie VOISENAT, *UMR Héritages, Ministère de la Culture*

Nathalie CEREZALES, *HICSA, Université de Paris 1* ; **Jean-Christophe MONFERRAN**, *UMR Héritages, CNRS* ; **Gaspard SALATKO**, *Fondation des Sciences du Patrimoine / Institut National du Patrimoine*

This research project questions the fate of the remains of the Paris Cathedral fire: materials for scientific research; testimonies of the testimonies of the disaster for the Ministry and the Clergy; objects of public greed as intimate relics whose status has to be defined between sacred and memorial; symbols of the resilience of the monument (such as the "coq reliquaire" presented during the Heritage Days [*Journées du patrimoine*] in September 2019). The observation and analysis of the fate of these debris, standing in between the material, the vestige and the relic, open up new perspectives on the relationship between worship and culture, the question of the sacred and the transfer of sacredness, the links between science and religion.